



Melbourne Debating Academy Regional Semi-final

That animal testing should be legal

Background:

Animal testing is typically referred to as the scientific testing of products intended for humans on animals before they are sold to humans.

Animal testing was previously unregulated, but became fully illegal in July 2020 in Australia. There are great divisions on the issue of the legality of animal testing, with some arguing that it is unethical to subject animals to chemicals we are uncertain will harm or debilitate them, whereas others suggest that it would be better if a few animals experienced this instead of living human beings, which risks their lives. This identifies the primary clash of the conflicting stakeholder groups, and thus the importance of debate.

Your team needs to consider the ethical implications of animal testing and compare them to the needs of the human race to argue the contention that animal testing should/ should not be legal. Debaters should be aware that just because something is harmful to one key stakeholder within the debate, it does not mean that the debate is instantly won by that team. There can be other benefits which arise out of that harm which can make the harms we incur worthwhile. Alternatively, those harms could be too significant. The best team will not necessarily prove that their side has no harms/ suggest that the other side only has harms, but instead suggest something far more nuanced, which is that that they can maximise benefits and minimise harm through their version of the topic and provide reasons for that. Such an argumentative/ logical line is readily available to both sides of the cases, making this a fair debate no matter which side of the topic you are on.

Key questions for consideration:

- Who are the stakeholders in this debate? (who benefits? who is harmed?)
- What are the alternatives to animal testing? (how advanced are these alternatives?)
- What are the implications of animal testing? (and on which stakeholders?)
- What are society's attitudes towards animal testing? (and to what extent should we care about these views)

Resources:

<https://www1.health.gov.au/internet/main/publishing.nsf/Content/ban-cosmetic-testing-animals#:~:text=The%20ban%20commenced%20on%201,animal%20testing%20to%20prove%20safety>

<https://animal-testing.procon.org/#:~:text=Proponents%20of%20animal%20testing%20say,mistreatment%20of%20animals%20in%20laboratories>

<https://www.peta.org/issues/animals-used-for-experimentation/animals-used-experimentation-factsheets/animal-experiments-overview/>

<https://med.stanford.edu/animalresearch/why-animal-research.html>

<https://www.britannica.com/story/pro-and-con-animal-testing>